

ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION AGENDA

Tuesday, May 19, 2015

6:00 p.m.

50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room B

Applicants or their representatives must attend this meeting. If applicants are absent it is likely that the application will be continued until the Commission's next meeting. If you have any questions, please call Connie Torbeck (645-0664) in the City's Historic Preservation Office. If you need assistance in participating in this meeting due to a disability under the ADA, please call the City's ADA Coordinator at (614) 645-6504 or email raisbell@columbus.gov at least three (3) business days prior to the scheduled meeting or event to request an accommodation.

- I. CALL TO ORDER
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, June 9, 2015 – 50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room A
- III. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING – 6:00 pm, Tuesday, June 16, 2015 – 50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room B
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, April 21, 2015.
- VII. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Special Meeting - Monday, May 4, 2015.
- VIII. PUBLIC FORUM
- IX. STAFF APPROVALS
- X. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. 15-5-13

163 Punta Alley

Heidi Bolyard/Simplified Living Architecture (Applicant)

Gretchen Stephenson (Owner)

Item #1 has been moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by Historic Preservation Office Staff at the May 12th, 2015 IVC Business Meeting (See Staff Approvals, below).

Install New Door

Install Closed, Fixed Shutters

2. 15-5-14

1081 North Fourth Street

Barb Judson/Mae Fence (Applicant)

Michael Young (Owner)

Item #2 has been moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by Historic Preservation Office Staff at the May 12th, 2015 IVC Business Meeting (See Staff Approvals, below).

Install New Fence

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:05 P.M

3. 15-5-15

930 & 940 North High Street

H. Christopher Friend/Schooley Caldwell & Assoc. (Applicant)

The Brunner Building, LLC (Owner)

This application was conceptually reviewed on August 19, 2014. An application, site plan, photographs, and product example photograph have been submitted.

Demolition

- Demolish the circa 1940 concrete block building at 940 N. High Street.
- Demolish the highly modified, circa 1945 concrete block and brick building at 930 N. High Street.
- Remove all associated site utilities, including pavement, landscaping, fencing, and other site obstructions.

Excavation and Foundation Work for New Construction

- Begin excavation and foundation work for the proposed new construction, based on the submitted

4. 15-5-16

813 Summit Street

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Michael Casey (Owner)

The addition of a new dormer to the west elevation of the garage was approved November 11, 2014. An application, floor plans, photographs, and elevation drawings have been submitted.

Modify Previous Approval

- Modify the previously approved plans (COA # 14-11-24/November 11, 2014), by adding a shed dormer to the east elevation of the garage, per the submitted drawings.

HOLDOVERS

5. 15-4-20c

936 North Fourth Street

Kevin Noesner (Applicant/Owner)

An application, elevation drawings, and photographs have been submitted.

New Awning Signage

- Install new, black canvas on existing awning frame.
- Frame to be painted black.
- Awning signage to read, "GOREMADE PIZZA" on the slope of the awning, and "936 NORTH FOURTH STREET" on the front awning flap.

6. 15-4-29 (New Application/Exterior Alteration)

1044 North High Street

Brian Swanson (Applicant)

Fred Maloof (Owner)

An application, elevation drawings, section detail, and photographs have been submitted.

Install New NanaWall Window System

- Remove existing storefront windows, and install new folding window system.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:15 P.M

VARIANCE RECOMMENDATIONS

7. 15-5-17

200 East Fourth Avenue

Andrew Losinske (Applicant)

Heidi Koestner (Owner)

An application, site plan, statement of hardship, and photographs have been submitted.

Variance Recommendation

- 3312.49 – which requires a minimum number of parking spaces.
- Approximately forty spaces are required for the 3000 sq. ft. building.
- Three parking spaces exist behind the proposed restaurant, and eight spaces existing on the east side of the building.
- The applicant has secured a lease for twenty-five additional spaces at 995 North Fourth Street.

8. 15-5-18

285-295 East Fourth Avenue

Connie Klema (Applicant)

The New Victorians, Inc. (Owner)

An application, site plan, and statement of hardship have been submitted.

Request for Rezoning Recommendation

- Request for recommendation for rezoning from R-4 Residential Use and M-2 Manufacturing Use to AR-2 Apartment Residential Use.

Request for Variance Recommendation

References are to proposed lots as follows:

West lot that will be 10,640 sq. ft. "Lot #1"

East lot that will be 15,960 sq. ft. "Lot #2"

- 1. 3333.025 AR-2 apartment residential district use: To permit a dwelling containing fewer than three dwelling units and to permit one dwelling unit on Lot #1.
- 2. 3333.13 AR-2 area district requirements: To permit an apartment complex on a single lot that is less than 20,000 square feet and to be 15,960 square feet on Lot #2.
- 3. 3333.15(c) Basis of computing area: To permit residential buildings to be erected and occupy together greater than 50 percent of the lot area and to be 51% of the lot area on Lot #2.
- 4. 3333.16 Fronting: To permit an apartment house to not front on a public street on Lot #2.
- 5. 3333.18(D) Building lines: To permit setbacks to be less than ten feet (10') and to be 7' 1/8" along Sixth Avenue and 5' 4 7/8" along Fourth Avenue on Lot #1 and 6' 8 1/2" along Fourth Avenue on Lot #2.
- 6. 3333.25 Perimeter yard: To permit a perimeter yard to be less than ten feet and to be zero feet along the south and east property line of Lot #1, and to be 5' 2 1/2" along the south property line and 0 feet along the east property line of Lot #2 and to permit a dumpster to be located in the east perimeter yard of Lot #2.
- 7. 3312.13 Driveway: To permit a one way driveway serving more than eight parking spaces to be less than 20' wide and to be 12' 5.5" wide.
- 8. 3312.25 Maneuvering: To permit maneuvering for one car (noted as C8 on site plan) to not be exclusive and to be shared on Lot #1 and to permit maneuvering to occur over the property line on Lot #2.
- 9. 3312.49 Off street parking: To permit less than 13 parking spaces on Lot #1 and to permit 11.
- 10. 3321.01(A) Dumpster: To permit a dumpster to be located in a perimeter yard.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:40 P.M

NEW APPLICATIONS

9. 15-5-19

1167 Mt. Pleasant Avenue

Romeo Issa & Moe Hassan (Applicant)

Roman & Deborah Czech (Owner)

An application and Photoshop renderings have been submitted.

Retain and Modify Existing Patio Enclosure

- The modification of the existing patio enclosure was approved on March 17, 2015 (see below).
- Modify the existing enclosure, including a wood frame structure and moveable vinyl walls, per the submitted photoshop renderings.

The following is from the minutes of the March 17, 2015 IVC hearing:

Approve Application #14-11-20, 1167 Mt. Pleasant Avenue, with all clarifications, as noted.

Retain and Modify Existing Patio Enclosure

- *Modify the existing patio enclosure, that was installed prior to review and approval.*
- *Revised drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.*
- *Revised drawings to reflect details and materials as discussed at the March 17, 2015 Italian Village Commission, including, 1) Cultured stone veneer and cementitious siding are not appropriate materials; 2) Metal framing with glass infill and glass overhead garage doors reflect the original auto-oriented use of the gas station building, and should be incorporated into the final design of the enclosure.*

MOTION: Sudy/Lapp (6-0-0) APPROVED

10. 15-5-20

1101 Say Avenue

Blostein/Overly Architecture (Applicant)

Matthew Brackman & Joe Benner (Owners)

Exterior alterations were approved at the November 2014 IVC meeting. An application site plan, floor plans, and elevation drawings have been submitted.

Modify Previous Approval

- Modify existing window composition of the north and south dormers.
- Modify the west elevation, per the submitted drawings.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 7:15 P.M

11. 15-4-37 (New Application/New Construction)

266 Third Street

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

New Victorians (Owner)

This application was conceptually reviewed at the April 21, 2015 IVC hearing. An application, site plan, floor plans, and elevation drawings have been submitted.

New Construction

- Construct a new, two-story, frame, single-family dwelling with detached garage, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Siding for house and garage to be 4" HardiePlank siding with 1 x 6 wood trim.
- Windows to be Marvin "Integrity" fiberglass-clad wood, one-over-one, double-hung sash windows.
- Roof to be asphalt shingle from the approved roofing shingle list with continuous metal ridge roll.
- Foundation to be plain-faced block.

- Cut sheets for exterior doors, windows, and light fixtures to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

The following is from the April 21, 2015 IVC minutes:

Commissioner Comments

Ben Goodman:

- Has some concerns about the two-story “plantation” porches. Encourages the applicants to consider less porch.
- Consider pulling some architectural features, including porch forms, from other, historic neighboring houses.

David Cooke:

- Brick would give the building an importance on the corner. It is not uncommon to have brick buildings anchoring corners in the village.
- Both of the neighboring new construction projects (to the east) have moderate to very contemporary features and some projecting features. Looking at those drawings may provide some cues.

Todd Boyer:

- This is on the corner and should not feel like an infill house. Will need to add windows on the west/street elevation.
- Also noted the contemporary features of the neighboring new construction projects.

NO ACTION TAKEN

12. 15-4-38 (New Application/New Construction)

No Address/SW crnr. Second Avenue & Fourth Street (formerly 941-943 N. Fourth St.)

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

New Victorians (Owner)

This application was conceptually reviewed at the April 21, 2015 IVC hearing. An application, site plan, photographs, and elevation drawings have been submitted.

New Construction

- Construct a new, two-story, frame, two-family dwelling with attached garage, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Siding to be 5 1/4 ” HardiePlank siding with 1 x 6 wood trim on the first and second floors, and 7 1/4” exposure on the third floor.
- Cut sheets for exterior doors, windows, and light fixtures to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

The following is from the April 21, 2015 IVC minutes:

Commissioner Comments

David Cooke:

- Thinks the corner element needs more weight. Perhaps something like a turret or tower to provide a focal point for the corner.
- The proposed integrated garages are not seen from the street. The garages could be jogged or have some screening to make them less visible.

Ben Goodman:

- This is a prominent corner. Would be supportive of bringing a building up to the street. Wonders about going with just two units at this time to avoid the vision clearance issue, leaving the corner lot open, for development in the future.

Josh Lapp:

- Agrees that an end element could help at the corner of the building.
- Referred to the historic siting of buildings at this corner, as shown on Sanborn maps.
- Will be interested in the corner, in general. There is not generally this much green space at a corner in the village.

- *This is not a completely residential street, but a multi-purpose street, so does not think that the integrated garages would be inappropriate at this site and with this scale.*

Todd Boyer:

- *A tower on the corner is a good idea. If a tower is used, all the other masses could be simplified.*
- *Another approach could be to make the corner the void corner, as traditionally done.*
- *Consider moving some of the program back toward the parking space and move the patio to a front porch, extending into the setback a bit.*

NO ACTION TAKEN

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 7:45 P.M

13. 15-4-38

920 North High Street

Sketch Blue on behalf of Donatos (Applicant)

Emerald Light Investments, Ltd. (Owner)

This application was conceptually reviewed at the May 4, 2015 IVC special meeting. An application and revised rendering have been submitted.

Signage

Install new signage for the Donatos and Black Brick restaurants, per the submitted signage package.

The following is from the May 4, 2015 IVC special meeting minutes:

Commissioner Comments

Ben Goodman:

- *It seems that the types of illuminated signage being proposed are in accordance with Short North Design Guidelines (Open face LED channel letters with the look of exposed neon; Halo illuminated channel letters).*
- *Could be supportive of some of the brick applied graphics because they are tone-on-tone and not illuminated.*
- *Has some concerns about the vertical “Donatos” on the front because it is not tone-on-tone and is illuminated. Could possibly support if it had a “distressed” look. Possibly better to be horizontal format.*
- *The “Pizza Love” on the awning seems inconsistent with past approvals of signage by the Commission.*

Todd Boyer:

- *Appreciates all of the different scales of the proposed signage package. It also approaches the artistic side, which is a positive.*
- *The vertical Donatos on the front and some of the tone-on-tone signage seems “billboard-like”, which the Commission has generally approved only as a temporary signage, such as the art murals.*
- *The pizza design on the front door is a good art piece.*
- *No issues with the proposed projecting signs or the scale of the “920” above the door.*
- *The “1963, Pizza Love”, etc. also seems too billboard like, even though they are tone-on-tone.*
- *Finds the “distressed” look approach interesting, but wonders how it would work on a modern building.*

Jason Sudy:

- *Also has concerns about the larger signage pieces. The use of tone-on-tone could possibly make some of the larger signs appropriate.*
- *Agrees that the verbiage such as “1963, Pizza Love”, “Craveable”, etc. is not consistent with past approvals, and concerned about the precedent it would set.*
- *The inclusion of website addresses is not generally approved.*

David Cooke:

- *Appreciates the diversity of the signage package.*
- *Appreciates the dedicated space for art/murals.*
- *Thinks the proposed projecting signs are appropriate.*

- *Would be supportive of a painted on “Donatos” if it had a weathered/aged look. Donatos has been at this location for a long time.*
- *The current signage package exceeds the allowed square footage for signage, so the overall package needs to be considered closely.*
- *Thinks the text on the door/window is fine, although it seems excessive.*
- *Would not support the “pizza love” on the front awning or the website on the rear awning.*

Charmaine Sutton:

No comments.

NO ACTION TAKEN

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 7:55 P.M

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

14. 14-11-22

Jeffrey Park Apartments/Phase IV - Waldron Street

Rob Harris (Applicant)

Jeffrey New Day, LLC. (Owner)

This application was conceptually reviewed at the November 18, 2014 and January 20, February 17, and March 2015 IVC meetings. An application and revised rendering have been submitted.

Construct New Apartment Building/Building “K”

- *Construct a new 216 unit, five-story apartment building, as part of the overall Jeffrey Park Development.*
- *Development to include 146 surface parking spaces and 265 parking garage spaces within a two level parking deck to the rear (total 411 spaces).*

The following is from the March 17, 2015 IVC minutes:

Commissioner Comments

Jason Sudy:

- *Disappointed to see that the monitor roof/clerestory windows is no longer proposed for the brick, industrial style building. Is not seeing the value of having parapet walls at either end of the building at all if nothing is behind them or connects them.*
- *Would want to see a sloped roof or a detailed type of cornice to reflect the industrial vernacular.*
- *The solutions on the garage seem right. Will need details on the light fixtures.*
- *Overall, the project is going in the right direction except for the roof of the brick industrial piece.*

David Cooke:

- *The south parapet wall on the brick industrial building will not really be visible except from I-670, so would propose, if the full clerestory can't be incorporated, to remove the stepped parapet on the south end.*
- *Appreciates the horizontal band course above the second floor that breaks up the mass of the brick industrial building.*
- *Appreciates the balcony overhangs on the contemporary pieces in the middle. Not sure about continuing the same features onto the brick building. Too many shared features could make it feel “project-like.,” which is a concern.*
- *Appreciates the darker, earthen color of the parking garage.*
- *The cog/wheel mural on the garage seems appropriate. Adds an art element. Could pull the wall up a bit higher to create a screen wall for use as an interchangeable mural.*
- *Referred to the Italian Village East Redevelopment Plan (2000) which encourages an increase in owner-occupied housing.*

Josh Lapp:

- *Is less comfortable with the design of the brick industrial building without the monitor roof/clerestory. It reflected the history of the Jeffrey Mining Company. Now feels a bit massive. The four sections seem like one big building. Would like to see a height change or some differentiation of the four sections.*

- *Noted that some of the color that was originally proposed and made the building stand out has been lost.*
- *Very supportive of the art aspect of the garage. Could also add sculptural elements.*
- *Would also support any public art space, something that could be an identifier that is not a sign.*
- *Would like to see future parts of the overall Jeffrey Park development include some commercial uses.*

Rex Hagerling:

- *Starting to get more comfortable with the proposed building, except for the change in the roofline of the brick industrial building.*
- *Commissioner Cooke's suggestion that the removal of the parapet wall on the south end may help, but the previously proposed roof had more heft. Any use of a parapet wall would need to be substantial.*
- *Would like to see renderings showing how this building will relate to other pieces of the Jeffrey Park Development and the existing buildings.*
- *Noted that the stone belt course above the second floor on the brick industrial building is helpful, but some other previously proposed details, such as soldier courses between windows, have been eliminated.*
- *Is okay with the more neutral tones, and would not want to see it be brightly colored.*

Todd Boyer:

- *Becoming more of a planar element resolves some of the previous "knuckle" connection issues.*
- *No further comments to add regarding the brick industrial building.*
- *Likes how the main entrance has been resolved. However, it is a five story building, with a six-foot door, that has the appearance of a residential rear door. Would like to see a bit stronger approach with the doors and windows on front and rear. The visitor needs to have a more clear signal of where the entrance is located.*
- *The exposed beams of the balconies are nice.*

Ben Goodman:

- *Is also disappointed at the loss of the monitor roof. The current proposal has the appearance of four boxes of the same height.*
- *If the monitor is going to be lost, would suggest pushing down the adjacent contemporary piece by one story to achieve a variety of rooflines.*
- *If this needs to be four boxes with punch-outs, it would be more appropriate to reflect an industrial building overall - buildings of varying height that reflect a more industrial composition.*
- *Thinks the garage should have some sort of panels attached to fit into the industrial composition.*
- *Would like to steer away from EIFS and brake metal and utilize quality windows and other materials, including landscaping/paving materials.*

NO ACTION TAKEN

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 8:10 P.M

15. 15-5-21

1160 North High Street & 14 East Fourth Avenue

Behal Sampson Dietz Architects (Applicant)

Stonewall Columbus, Inc. (Owner)

This application was conceptually reviewed at the December 16, 2014 IVC meeting. An application and revised renderings, site plan, floor plans, and elevation drawings have been submitted.

Construct Steel & Glass Bridge

- *Connect the two existing buildings with a steel and glass bridge, per the submitted drawings.*
- *Add an open, steel exit stairwell to the north side of 14 East Fourth Avenue.*
- *Add glass doors on the east wall of 1160 North High Street and on the west and north walls of 14 East Fourth Avenue.*
- *Create a dumpster enclosure at the northeast corner of the property.*
- *Install new landscaping east of 14 East Fourth Avenue.*
- *Provide handicap entrance in the existing opening on the east side of 14 East Fourth Avenue.*

- Install new aluminum storefront system in the 14 East Fourth Avenue storefront openings.
- Install suspended logo over front entrance of 1160 North High Street.
- Install signage on 14 East Fourth Avenue frontage.
- Create a roof terrace on 1160 North High Street.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 8:25 P.M

16. 15-5-22

995 North Fourth Street

Brad Parish/Architectural Alliance (Applicant)

Capitol Equities (Owner)

This application was conceptually reviewed at the March 17, 2015 IVC meeting. Site improvements to the front/east parking lot were approved at the May 4, 2015 special meeting, with revised drawings to be reviewed by Commissioner Sudy for final review. An application, site plan, photographs, and elevation drawings have been submitted.

Renovations to Brick Building

- Paint previously painted exterior walls.
- Install new windows on all elevations.
- Install new storefront and aluminum/glass overhead door on the front/east elevation.
- Install new signage canopy on front/east elevation.
- Install new aluminum/glass overhead door on the rear/west elevation.
- Install new metal door on rear/west elevation.
- Install new fiber cement board siding on rear and side elevations, per the submitted drawings.

Renovations to Concrete Block Building

- Paint previously painted, exterior concrete block walls, and install new fiber cement board siding and EIFS, as noted on all elevations, per the submitted drawings.
- Install new metal canopies, as noted on all elevations, per the submitted drawings.
- Install new aluminum storefront windows and doors, as noted on all elevations, per the submitted drawings.
- Install metal infill panels at top of windows on west elevation.
- Install new signage on east, north, and west elevations.

West Parking Lot

- Pave area on the west side of the lots, to provide 42 parking spaces, per the submitted site plan.
- Install new fence and landscaping, per the submitted site plan.

The following is from the March 17, 2015 IVC meeting minutes:

Commissioner Comments

Josh Lapp:

- *Appreciates that the Applicants/Owners are proposing to preserve the former wagon house [of the Capital City Dairy Co.]. Does not have strong concerns about preserving the concrete block building.*
- *Does have strong concerns about the parking areas. The front parking lot is large in itself. To add a rear parking lot is too much. Would not be likely to support addition of a second parking lot or maintaining a parking lot that should not have been paved.*
- *Long-term, thinks the front paved parking area would serve better as green space or as new development rather than being preserved as a parking lot.*

Jason Sudy:

- *Except for the proposed reuse of the wagon house, thinks that the current proposal is going in a completely wrong direction.*
- *If further research reveals that the concrete block building has some historical or architectural significance, there may be an argument for preserving some parts of it.*

- *If the existing concrete block building were to be removed, the site of that building is where parking should be located for this square.*
- *This is a classic, infill block site in an urban neighborhood, with significant edges on three sides, and the Commission would like to see those edges be respected, as the previous proposal started to do. Maintaining the existing parking lot and adding a second surface lot would negatively impact the neighborhood.*
- *If the existing parking lot area remains, significant changes will need to be made to be code compliant.*
- *There are relatively small-scale, single-family homes in the rear area of the site that need to be respected.*
- *The design is attractive, but just not the right use of a building in this particular location.*
- *Would not be in favor of maintaining the existing parking lot or adding another parking lot at the rear.*

David Cooke:

- *Appreciates the proposed rehabilitation of the brick building.*
- *Is concerned that the current proposal does not address the current code and zoning violations.*
- *Could not approve other areas of the site before the front parking lot is addressed. The lot is paved right up to the sidewalk with no stops to prevent driving over the sidewalk.*
- *It is important to promote pedestrian experiences in the neighborhood.*
- *Referred the Applicants to the Italian Village East Redevelopment Plan (2000) regarding pedestrian experiences, street rhythm and surface parking lots.*
- *The first priority is to address the current code and zoning violation issues before any further review.*

Rex Hagerling:

- *In general agreement with comments of fellow Commissioners.*
- *Not only the Italian Village Guidelines, but the Urban Commercial Overlay addresses the inappropriate use of large surface parking lots in front of a building.*
- *Thinks that a good part of the concrete block building could be demolished, but does think that the west wall is an interesting historical artifact. Thinks the concrete block building could be built out toward the sidewalk. Perhaps the west wall could be an interesting element of a parking area.*
- *Appreciates that the brick building is to be preserved and likes the proposal for that building.*

Ben Goodman:

- *Agrees that the parking lot needs to be remediated to improve the streetscape.*
- *Is not opposed to the style or repurposing of the existing concrete block building. Sometimes working with what is existing can be a good solution.*
- *Not necessarily on board with automatic demolition of the existing concrete block building. Could see the existing building being built out toward Fourth Street.*
- *For future development, imagine how townhomes could be facing Third Avenue, Punta or Hamlet as a more full, quality development.*

NO ACTION TAKEN

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 8:45 P.M

17. 15-3-19

1086 & 1050 North Fourth Street – Budd Dairy Redevelopment

Tim Lai (Applicant)

Lykens Companies (Owner)

This application was conceptually reviewed at the March 17, 2015 IVC meeting. A site visit was conducted by the Commission on May 4th. An application, photographs, and renderings have been submitted.

Demolition

- *Demolish the five (5) existing, brick garage and warehouse buildings located to the rear of the two-story Budd Dairy building.*
- *Demolish the existing concrete block building at 1050 North Fourth Street.*

New Construction

- Construct four new buildings, per the submitted site plan and renderings.

The following is from the March 17, 2015 IVC meeting minutes:

Commissioner Comments

David Cooke:

- *In support of a mixed-use project which fits in with the Italian Village East Redevelopment Plan.*
- *Appreciates the goal of not building a single massive building on the site.*
- *Is concerned that the combined buildings currently would have the appearance of a single developer project.*
- *Has concerns about demolishing the Durable Slate building. Several examples of similar buildings in Italian Village (e.g. Fox in the Snow) have been rehabbed and work really well. Not in favor of removing buildings that have the potential for being something unique in order to build something uniform.*
- *Is not supportive of the proposed curved sidewalk line, which is not original to the character of the neighborhood. In support of green space, but would not add an arch to the street.*
- *The buildings seem too compatible. Building 1 and 6 bookend the project and make it look more like a single project, other than the Budd Dairy Building.*

Josh Lapp:

- *Could support the demolition of the Durable Slate building. Would like to see the details of the façade saved and incorporated into a new building behind it. Thinks it could be a nice contemporary contrast with that historical element. Thinks the historical element could be an attraction for residents.*
- *Thinks there should be a diversity of architecture among the buildings so it does not have the appearance of a single large project.*
- *Supports the mixed use. Is a bit more concerned with the form than the function, but thinks the Fourth Street streetscape should have some retail use, or the appearance of retail.*
- *Not sure about the arc along the entire front sidewalk. Green space may make the most sense just in front of the Dairy and a two adjacent buildings with deeper setbacks.*
- *Supports the use of whimsical art, i.e., cows.*

Rex Hagerling:

- *Thinks that at least the façade of the 1949 piece of the Durable Slate building should be retained. Would not oppose demolishing much of the rest of it (white concrete block).*
- *Completely opposed to demolishing the one story warehouse buildings behind Budd Dairy. These buildings are the essence of what the Commission is charged with maintaining. This is a really fantastic opportunity to do a really incredible adaptive use.*
- *Would like to see the project start with the two historic building elements and go from there.*

Jason Sudy:

- *Overall, this project will have a huge impact on the Fourth Street corridor.*
- *Would like to have more information about the original Durable Slate building and additions, and how reusing the front façade could work. Also interested in seeing the rest of the façade brought up to Fourth Street, where there has been a long term parking lot.*
- *Needs to think more about the use or demolition of the Budd Dairy warehouse buildings. Applicant should look into the possibilities of utilizing some of them for interior parking.*
- *The general approach is smart from a siting perspective.*
- *Has concerns about a lot of parking on a first story, as with Building 6.*
- *Thinks Buildings 1 and 6 should be different from the other buildings in some manner. Not necessarily traditional, maybe just an associated vernacular.*

Todd Boyer:

- *Needs a better understanding of the public/private goals of the project. The sameness of the architecture still gives the buildings the appearance of a one developer project.*

- *Is very opposed to demolishing the Budd Dairy warehouse buildings. There is also a big opportunity to do something with the Durable Slate building.*
- *Would not want to see the slate wiped clean to try to recreate a community and interesting spaces that are already there. We could never get that back.*
- *The redevelopment of the main building of the Budd Dairy will be easy. The warehouses will be more difficult but will be the more successful piece.*
- *Does not think that all of the pieces of the development need to respond just to the Budd Dairy. Thinks there is a grander context that the buildings need to respond to.*

Ben Goodman:

- *Appreciates the logic, principles, and history materials presented by the Applicants.*
- *Thinks that the setback ideas area great. Just need to remove the reference to an arc and eliminate the curved sidewalks.*
- *Is a proponent of alleys, and would want to see the alley connection maintained.*
- *Has some concerns about demolition of the warehouse spaces of the Budd Dairy. Not sure they couldn't be torn down, but there is potential there.*
- *Thinks it may be a good approach to start with Buildings 2, 3, and 5 before approaching 1, 4, and 6.*
- *Agrees that more diversity, especially with Buildings 1 and 6 would be good as a pedestrian and as a motorist.*
- *Thinks that the pattern of Building 1 and 6 may be too frenetic for facing onto Fourth Street.*

NO ACTION TAKEN

STAFF APPROVALS

• **15-5-1**

192-194 East Second Avenue

Will Carrel/Contractor (Applicant)

Jack Zweig (Owner)

Approve Application 15-5-1, 192-194 East Second Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Half-Round Gutters

- Install new half-round gutters on the crown molding, due to box gutters being previously covered with an extended roof.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia and crown molding with new wood of same dimension, as necessary.
- Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.
- Install new, 5", half-round metal gutters and new round, metal down spouts of the appropriate dimension. Finish color to match the existing trim color.
- Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Install New Drain Pipe From Downspouts

- Install new drain pipes from the gutter/downspouts, beneath the public sidewalk to the existing stone curb, in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- Reinstall any damaged stone curbing, like-for-like, as needed. New curbing not to be concrete.

Remove Existing Sidewalks and Install New Sidewalks

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, concrete public and service sidewalks and steps, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new concrete in the exact same location and of the exact same dimension, as necessary.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as necessary, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Finish coat paint colors to match existing.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

Porch Repair

- Repair/replace the existing concrete porch deck, as needed, with new concrete, like-for-like.

Repair Masonry Retaining Wall

- Remove any/all damaged concrete block and replace with concrete block that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- Moisten surface with water and solid point with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>).
- The height, thickness, and length of the masonry wall is to remain the same following the completion of all repairs.

- **15-5-2**

682 North High Street

Alissa Head, Mngr. Global Gifts (Applicant)

The Wood Companies (Owners)

Approve Application #15-5-2, 682 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Signage

- Install new, burgundy color, vinyl lettering signage to read "Global Gifts: A Fair Trade Store," per the submitted rendering.
- Signage to be located in the sign band above the storefront windows, to match the two neighboring businesses.
- The existing vinyl lettering on the storefront windows is to be removed.

Note: COA # 15-5-2 modifies the color and font only for the previously approved signage (COA #15-2-2 / approved 2-17-2015).

- **15-5-3**

830 North High Street

James Brooks/Custom Sign Center (Applicant)

E.W. Hubbard High, LLC (Owners)

Approve Application #15-5-3, 830 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Modify Existing Projecting Sign

- Change the existing background color of the existing projecting sign from metallic gray to PMS 368 (green), per the submitted drawing and material/color sample.

Note: COA # 15-5-3 modifies the color only for the previously approved sign (COA #13-10-8 / approved 10-15-2013).

• **15-5-4**

55 East Warren Street

Jenifer Teitt/The Bellepoint Company (Applicant)

Jason Thompson (Owners)

Approve Application #15-5-4, 55 East Warren Street, for renewal of expired COA # 14-2-3c (Expired: February 18, 2014), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Remove Slate and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove existing deteriorated slate, and install new asphalt shingle roof, per the submitted specifications.
- Remove all deteriorated slate on the main roof of the house, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be Owens Corning, (standard 3-tab), "Estate Gray."
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or gray.
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or gray.
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Front Porch Roof

- Power wash existing, metal, front porch roof and apply metal ready primer and gray tinted elastomeric roof coating.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-0) APPROVED

• **15-5-5**

723-729 Kerr Street

Ben Shoemaker (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #15-5-5, 723-729 Kerr Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:
Certain Teed

Style:
(standard 3-tab)

Color:
Nickel Gray

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red."

- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the flat portion of the roof down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.

Eave Soffit & Fascia Repair:

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffit and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Repair or Replace Gutters & Downspouts:

- Repair and or replace gutters and downspouts, as needed.

Replace Existing Hat Vents:

- Replace five (5) existing hat vents with new hat vents; no new hat vents to be added.

- **15-5-6**

959 Mount Pleasant Avenue

Matthew Minerd (Applicant)

Matthew Minerd & Amelia Dunlap (Owner)

Approve Application #15-5-6, 959 Mount Pleasant Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Exterior Painting – House & Garage

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house and fiber cement surfaces on the garage for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to be Sherwin Williams Downing Stone (2821) as primary and Sherwin Williams Sage Green Light (2851) for trim, as shown in submittal.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**

- **15-5-7**

830 North High Street

James Brooks/Custom Sign Center (Applicant)

E.W. Hubbard High, LLC (Owners)

Approve Application #15-5-7, 830 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Modify Existing Projecting Sign

- Change the existing graphic (logo with the name "Huntington") and metallic gray color of the existing projecting sign to include the Huntington logo only on a PMS 368 (green) field, per the submitted drawing and material/color sample.

Note: COA # 15-5-3 modifies the sign face only for the previously approved sign, COA #15-5-3, issued 4-22-2015.

- **15-5-8**

181-183 East Second Avenue

Julio Valenzuela (Applicant)

Hamlet & Second LLC. (Owner)

Approve Application #15-5-8, 181-183 East Second Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the flat roof down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Existing clay coping at parapet walls to be retained.

- **15-5-9**

950-952 Hamlet Street

Julio Valenzuela (Applicant)

Hamlet & Second LLC. (Owner)

Approve Application #15-5-9, 950-952 Hamlet Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the flat roof down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Existing clay coping at parapet walls to be retained.

- **15-5-10**

944-946 Hamlet Street

Julio Valenzuela (Applicant)

Hamlet & Second LLC. (Owner)

Approve Application #15-5-9, 950-952 Hamlet Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the flat roof down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Existing clay coping at parapet walls to be retained.

- **15-5-11**

143-145 East Third Avenue

Kimberly Wells (Applicant)

Kimberly Wells/Purple Kangaroo, LLC. (Owner)

Approve Application #15-5-11, 143-145 East Third Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Finish coat paint colors to be as follows: Main Body – Behr “Opera Glass”; Trim – Behr “Statuesque”; and Doors – Behr “Red My Mind.”
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

- **15-5-12**

151 East Third Avenue

Mark Grillo (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #15-5-12, 151 East Third Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Gate

- Install one (1) new, spring-loaded, 12'8" wide, double-swing gate on the west side of the existing six-foot-high, wood privacy fence.
- Gate frame to be 1 5/8" round steel tubing and installed on existing wood posts.
- New cedar gate to match the height and construction/framing of the existing cedar fence.
- All work to be in accordance with all applicable Columbus City Codes and industry standards.

- **15-5-13**

163 Punta Alley

Heidi Bolyard/Simplified Living Architecture (Applicant)

Gretchen Stephenson (Owner)

Converted to Staff Approval following HPO Staff presentation at the May 12th IVC Business Meeting.

Approve Application #15-5-12-3, 163 Punta Alley, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Door

- Remove the existing, deteriorated, wood, 2' 8" wide, ¾ -lite door on the rear elevation, per the submitted photographs.
- Install a new, 3' wide, Jeld-Wen, full-lite (no muntins) Custom Wood patio door with wood transom (no muntins), per the submitted product cut sheet.

Note: The Commission strongly recommends that the ¾ -lite door be consigned to an architectural salvage company for reuse.

Install Closed, Fixed Shutters

- Remove one existing window on the east elevation at the rear of the main section of the house, per the submitted photographs.
- Install new, fixed, wood shutters in the closed position, to match the existing wood shutters on the adjacent window.
- The one, existing, two-over-two, double-hung sash window on the east elevation near the front of the main section of the house is to remain, as is.

- **15-5-14**

1081 North Fourth Street

Barb Judson/Mae Fence (Applicant)

Michael Young (Owner)

Converted to Staff Approval following HPO Staff presentation at the May 12th IVC Business Meeting.

Approve Application #15-5-14, 1081 North Fourth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Fence

- Install approximately seventy feet of 36" high, black, aluminum fence, along the south, east, and north sides of the front yard, per the submitted site plan and product cut sheet/specifications.
- New fence is to extend eastward, in line with the neighboring wood fence at 1077 N. Fourth Street; then northward, along the front of the property, in line with the concrete step, to the existing hedgerow; then westward to the northeast corner of the house.
- Matching aluminum gates to be located at the service sidewalk, per the submitted site plan.
- The top line of all fencing is to be level.

XI. OLD BUSINESS

15-5-19

1085 Summit Street

Susan Keeny (Applicant)

Bob Mickley (Owner)

Historic Preservation has conducted a site visit.

- Update on siding and windows, as installed.

1024 N. High Street

Change Paint Color

- Change the color of the narrow vertical strip, and the narrow horizontal strip of brick on the south elevation of the Fireproof Building from "red" to "dark grey" per the submitted photoshop images.

XII. NEW BUSINESS

XIII. ADJOURNMENT